



CALIFORNIA STATE ATHLETIC COMMISSION

2005 Evergreen Street, Suite 2010 | Sacramento, CA 95815

Phone: (916) 263-2195 | Fax: (916) 263-2197

Website: www.dca.ca.gov/csac | Email: csac@dca.ca.gov



Members of the Commission

John Carvelli, Chair
Mary Lehman, Vice Chair
Martha Shen-Urquidez
Van Gordon Sauter
Vernon Williams, M.D.
Luis Ayala
James Araby

Agenda items may be taken out of order the
agenda except public comment.
Action may be taken on any item listed on

CALIFORNIA STATE ATHLETIC COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, May 14, 2019

10:00 a.m. - Conclusion of Business

Location:

*Millennium Biltmore Hotel
506 South Grand Avenue, Heinsbergen Room
Los Angeles, CA 90017*

Commissioners Present

Chair John Carvelli
Vice Chair Mary Lehman
Commissioner Martha Shen-Urquidez
Commissioner Vernon Williams, MD
Commissioner Luis Ayala
Commissioner James Araby

Staff Present

Andy Foster, Executive Officer
Kenneth Swenson, Legal Counsel
Patrisha Blackstock, Staff

OPEN SESSION

**Agenda Item 1 – Call the meeting to Order / Roll Call / Pledge of Allegiance/
Establishment of Quorum**

The meeting was called to order at 10:00 a.m. by Chair John Carvelli. Executive Officer (EO) Andy Foster called roll and a quorum was established; Commissioner Van Gordon Sauter was not present.

Agenda Item 2 – Welcome –Chairman’s opening remarks

Chair John Carvelli announced that the Commission had a record-breaking year with number events held and revenue. Chair Carvelli complimented the staff and associates for their hard work and thanked the athletes who compete in California.

Agenda Item 3 – Approval of the February 19, 2019, Commission Meeting Minutes

EO Foster presented the February 19, 2019, Commission meeting minutes for approval.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez motioned to approve the minutes.

Commissioner Araby seconded the motion.

Public Comments

Mr. Patschull was asked to keep his comments on topic and relevant to the minutes by Chair Carvelli. Mr. Patschull stated his calls and emails to the Commission are still blocked even though EO Foster was instructed to unblock him. Chair Carvelli stated EO Foster was not so instructed. CSAC legal counsel stated Mr. Patschull's comments were not pertinent to the minutes.

The motion to approve the minutes passed 6-0 by roll call vote.

Agenda Item 4- Appeal of the Kubrat Pulev Administrative Suspension for violation of California Code of Regulations, title 4, section 390 issued on March 26, 2019.

EO Foster informed the Commission action was taken against Kubrat Pulev's boxing license and Mr. Pulev was present with his attorney, Ms. Mira Hashmall. EO Foster presented the Commission with the Division of Investigation's final report and supporting documentation.

Deputy Attorney General (DAG), Langston Edwards, presented the Commission with 7 exhibits pertaining to Kubrat Pulev's administrative suspension. Both parties stipulated to presentation of the exhibits. They were added to the record. Witness for the Commission, Jenny Ravalo, was present with her attorney, Gloria Allred and sworn in.

DAG Edwards questioned the witness. He asked Ms. Ravalo how long she had been a reporter with the Vegas Sports Daily Journal. She responded 4 months. Deputy AG Edwards asked Ms. Ravalo if she had covered boxing events before. She responded she had and she was assigned to the Pulev vs. Dinu event because she lives in Orange County. Deputy AG Edwards asked Ms. Ravalo if she covered other boxers while there. Ravalo responded she covered a few other boxers. Deputy AG Edwards asked Ms. Ravalo if she covered Mr. Pulev before the event. She responded she interviewed Mr. Pulev at the weigh-ins. Ms. Ravalo was asked by Deputy AG Edwards if she was accompanied by a videographer. She responded she was not, she conducted the interview alone with her camera phone on a selfie stick. She stated the interview was conducted in the main tent after fight, but she wasn't sure how soon after the fight it was. Deputy AG Edwards asked Ms. Ravalo if she'd had a chance to see the interview video and if the questions she asked were standard. Ms. Ravalo responded she had seen the video and, those were standard questions.

Deputy AG General Edwards stated in the last 10 seconds of the video, Mr. Pulev can be seen kissing Ms. Ravalo. He asked Ms. Ravalo if at any time prior to the start of the video

she consented to the kiss. She responded she had not consented. Deputy AG Edwards asked Ms. Ravalo if anything happened after she collected her belongings when the interview was over. Ms. Ravalo responded when she went to collect her belongings Mr. Pulev grabbed both her buttocks. Ms. Ravalo was asked how that made her feel. She responded that it made her feel humiliated and she collected her items and left.

Deputy AG Edwards stated the video of Mr. Pulev kissing Ms. Ravalo has over 3 million views. Ms. Ravalo was asked what has happened, if anything, since the video was posted. Ms. Ravalo responded since the video was posted she has been “slut shamed”, “cyber-bullied” and threatened. Deputy AG Edwards asked Ms. Ravalo if she received any threats from Mr. Pulev. Ms. Ravalo responded she hadn’t received any threats from Mr. Pulev directly, but Mr. Pulev used his people to go after her. Ms. Ravalo also stated that Mr. Pulev apologized to his fans but has yet to apologize to her.

Mr. Pulev’s attorney, Ms. Hashmall, stated Mr. Pulev is a proud resident of Bulgaria and he views this as very important and wants to ensure this has been seen and heard. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she had ever done a TV pre-fight sports interview before. Ms. Ravalo responded she had at the Ruiz vs. Davis fight. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she had ever done any post-fight interviews. Ms. Ravalo responded she hadn’t. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she had a press pass for the Kubrat vs. Dinu event. Ms. Ravalo responded she did and it was in her name. Ms. Ravalo was asked where she met Mr. Pulev. Ms. Ravalo responded she met Mr. Pulev for the first time at the pre-fight weigh-in. Ms. Hashmall presented the Commission with photographs and copies of text messages as exhibit “1.” The Commission accepted the exhibit. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if one of the photos was of her and Mr. Pulev at the pre-fight interview. Ms. Ravalo responded that it was

Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she recorded the post-fight interview. Ms. Ravalo responded she did. Ms. Ravalo was asked if she posted the video of the post-fight interview. She responded she did. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo when she posted the video. Ms. Ravalo responded she posted the video the same night. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she asked Mr. Pulev where the post-fight party was going to be. Ms. Ravalo responded she did not ask that question. Ms. Hashmall referred to an image of a text message submitted to the Commission showing Ms. Ravalo did ask Mr. Pulev’s friend George about the after party.

Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo how many drinks she consumed while she was at the fight. She responded she drank half of one drink. Ms. Hashmall asked if Ms. Ravalo had let George, Mr. Pulev’s cousin, buy her those drinks, she stated she had. Ms. Hashmall stated Ms. Ravalo approached Mr. Pulev 15 minutes after his fight requesting an interview. Mr. Pulev asked her to wait as he was focused on his fans after the fight. However, Ms. Ravalo was being pushy, even though Mr. Pulev asked her to respect his time. Ms. Ravalo stated she didn’t remember those words exactly, but he did ask her to wait until he was done with the fans.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez warned both sides the hearing would not be a bashing and smashing session of the witnesses and a “he said, she said” hearing. The Commission saw the video and the issue is whether Mr. Pulev had a defense and whether his actions were a discredit to the sport of boxing. What Ms. Ravalo did before or after the video has no bearing in the matter.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated this will not be a hearing where either side will be given the opportunity to discredit Ms. Ravalo or make her feel uncomfortable. The commissioner directed counsel to ask a question which goes towards a proper defense. Ms. Hashmall stated she appreciated the commissioner’s comments and stated the issue was whether Mr. Pulev’s actions brought discredit to boxing and the interactions between them before, during and after the interview were relevant to Mr. Pulev’s understanding, particularly given Mr. Ravalo breached the ethics of reporters. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated the Commission doesn’t license reporters and if they have an issue with Ms. Ravalo’s conduct, bring it up to whomever regulates reporters. The Commission’s duty is to regulate boxers, her client, and directed counsel to move on to other questions.

Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she understood that Mr. Pulev had just taken some serious blows to the head and if she considered the fact that he could have been dazed and not himself during the post-fight interview. Commissioner Williams objected to that line of questioning as Ms. Ravalo is not a medical professional. Ms. Hashmall then stated Ms. Ravalo saw he didn’t understand all her questions as he had a translator with him.

Ms. Hashmall stated in the video Ms. Ravalo can be seen laughing. Ms. Ravalo stated it was a nervous laugh. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she stated Mr. Pulev grabbed her butt, she answered yes. Ms. Hashmall asked if Ms. Ravalo felt disgusted, Ms. Ravalo responded yes. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she was so disgusted then why did she spend hours at an after party with his friends and family. Deputy AG objected on grounds that that question was not relevant. Ms. Hashmall stated an accusation was made of conduct not seen on the video. Chair Carvelli pointed out this meeting was not a court of law. Ms. Hashmall stated the questions were important to the truth-seeking process. Chair Carvelli informed Ms. Hashmall she was going to run out of time. Ms. Hashmall stated Ms. Ravalo said she was invited to the after party, but text messages show that Ms. Ravalo sent out the invites. Deputy AG objected stating the questions were misleading. Mr. Swenson recommended the objection be sustained and to move on to another subject. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if it was true she was so intoxicated she needed someone else to drive her vehicle and that she stayed at the after party until almost 7am. Chair Carvelli stated he was uncomfortable with this line of questioning and Ms. Hashmall needed to move on or he would ask someone else to speak.

Ms. Hashmall stated Ms. Ravalo said she was invited to the after party and text messages pertaining to that were provided to the Commission. Ms. Hashmall stated when Mr. Pulev saw Ms. Ravalo at the after party he asked her to remove the kiss from the interview video

and Ms. Ravalo said she would. Ms. Ravalo stated she didn't remember saying that to Mr. Pulev. Ms. Hashmall stated in fact Ms. Ravalo had already posted the video to her YouTube channel and didn't tell Mr. Pulev she had even after they spent hours together at the after party. Furthermore, she stated if Ms. Ravalo was so concerned about her image she wouldn't have posted the video, nor would she have left the videos up on her YouTube channel. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she kissed and danced on Mr. Pulev at the after party. Ms. Ravalo said she did not. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she was so offended by the kiss then why did she post it? Ms. Ravalo responded she posted the kiss because she wanted everyone to see what Mr. Pulev had done. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she considered the impact of posting the video would have on Mr. Pulev. Chair Carvelli informed Ms. Ravalo she didn't have to answer that question. Ms. Hashmall asked Ms. Ravalo if she considered the impact of posting the video would have on the sport of boxing. Chair Carvelli informed Ms. Ravalo she didn't have to answer that question

Witnesses Kubrat Pulev and translator Ivan Ylogutzev were sworn in. Mr. Pulev stated he kissed Ms. Ravalo because after a tough battle he almost lost in round 4, one of the most important fights in his career or life, he was so elated and felt happiness and grateful for the accomplishment. He continued by saying after such a tough battle, he was emotional and wanted to talk to his fans. He hadn't decided if he wanted to see the doctor or go to the hospital for the cut and that was when Ms. Ravalo approached him. Mr. Pulev felt as though Ms. Ravalo was aggressive and wasn't considering he was talking to his fans. He told her to have patience and he would do the interview in 10 minutes.

Mr. Pulev stated he met Ms. Ravalo the day before at the weigh-ins and had a great interview with her and she was kind. He stated the interview with Ms. Ravalo at the weigh ins was great and afterwards he joined his friend George. While he and George were driving they saw Ms. Ravalo sitting in her car and that was when she asked them where they were going to celebrate the win. Mr. Pulev stated he was surprised to hear that as he still had to get the win and that's when Ms. Ravalo said he would get the win, where would the party be.

Mr. Pulev stated the post-fight interview was in his dressing room and he told Ms. Ravalo just a few questions because he needed to get ready. Mr. Pulev said he didn't understand all the questions Ms. Ravalo asked but he kissed her because he was extremely happy and emotional. Mr. Pulev stated he knew the kiss was a mistake and wanted to apologize to Ms. Ravalo. Mr. Pulev stated Ms. Ravalo was very thankful for the interview, and when the interview was finished they hugged. Mr. Pulev denies the allegation he touched Ms. Ravalo's buttocks. Mr. Pulev further stated when the interview was finished he went to the hospital to get stitched up.

When Mr. Pulev arrived at the after party in the lobby of the hotel, he stated Ms. Ravalo sat beside him and kept complimenting him. Mr. Pulev stated later during the party Ms. Ravalo kissed him while he was sitting on the couch in the lobby. Mr. Pulev stated he

asked Ms. Ravalo to erase the part of the video where he kissed her because he was emotional and didn't want his girlfriend to see it. Mr. Pulev concluded his statement by saying Ms. Ravalo said she would erase the kiss and he felt Ms. Ravalo was more like a friend instead of a journalist.

Ms. Allred representing Ms. Ravalo stated Mr. Pulev is attempting to explain away the kiss by stating Ms. Ravalo and he were friends and that must mean that Mr. Pulev can't tell the difference when someone is working or flirting. Ms. Allred stated by Mr. Pulev attempting to paint Ms. Ravalo as something she is not doesn't change what happened and anything that happened after the kiss has no bearing on what happened during the interview. Ms. Allred stated Mr. Pulev said he kissed Ms. Ravalo out of happiness but if that is true can Mr. Pulev be trusted in the future and what will Mr. Pulev do if he is unhappy after a loss? Ms. Allred further stated Mr. Pulev threatened to release videos of Ms. Ravalo if she didn't remove the video from the internet and he later did retaliate against Ms. Ravalo.

DAG Edwards asked Mr. Pulev how many interviews he has done in the past and Mr. Pulev responded millions. Mr. Pulev was asked if he had ever kissed any of them, he responded no. Deputy AG Edwards asked Mr. Pulev if he asked Ms. Ravalo if he could kiss her, he responded no he did not.

DAG Edwards stated that Mr. Pulev stated during his questioning he was happy during the interview and felt that Ms. Ravalo was too flirty, and she wanted more than a kiss and could have wanted more. DAG Edwards asked Mr. Pulev if Ms. Ravalo ever said that to him. He answered "no." DAG Edwards asked Mr. Pulev if he stated he believed the kiss didn't bother Ms. Ravalo. Mr. Pulev said "yes." Pulev testified if the video is replayed, Ms. Ravalo can be seen participating in the kiss. Mr. Pulev was asked by DAG Edwards if he asked her if the kiss had bothered her? Mr. Pulev stated that there was no reason to ask as Ms. Ravalo appeared to be happy. DAG Edwards stated Mr. Pulev appeared to apologize at the hearing, but it was only days ago when he stated he believed himself to be the victim. Mr. Pulev stated first his license was suspended without a hearing and this was punishment already.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Ms. Ravalo how she would like to see this issue resolved. Ms. Ravalo responded she would like to see Mr. Pulev suspended. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev if he understood what he was apologizing for today? Mr. Pulev responded "yes," he did, up until the hearing, he had not seen Ms. Ravalo in person to apologize. He stated he wants to be polite to all people.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated to Mr. Pulev she didn't believe he fully understood what he did was wrong. She confirmed with him whether he would be the number one heavyweight contender if he wasn't currently suspended. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez made an analogy to help him better understand his actions. She asked him to pretend he was the champion in the ring and about to defend his title. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev to pretend he gave someone who was extremely grateful for the

opportunity, the chance to fight him, someone like him, who, if he won, could really improve his status in the next fight. This fighter is so, so happy to be there. He's elated. Round 1 is about to start and the referee has brought Mr. Pulev and his opponent to the center of the ring for instructions. In a moment of extreme happiness, his opponent leans over to Mr. Pulev and kisses Mr. Pulev right on the mouth.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev whether that was meant as sexual and answered, that it was probably not when Mr. Pulev shook his head. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev whether that kiss was meant as violent towards Mr. Pulev and answered it was probably not when Mr. Pulev shook his head. However, Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev whether it was highly inappropriate, creepy and disrespectfully to the referee, to the fans, to the promoter, the broadcaster, and answered that it was when Mr. Pulev nodded.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev whether he would continue to box his opponent in the ring and do his job or run away and hide in his apartment or go to the emergency room, and answered, of course he would when Mr. Pulev nodded. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev whether that kiss was still inappropriate, unprofessional and whether it creeped Mr. Pulev out when he thought about it and answered yes when Mr. Pulev nodded.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated the analogy she presented to Mr. Pulev was like what Mr. Pulev did to Ms. Ravalo and his actions interrupted Ms. Ravalo's ability to do her job. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked Mr. Pulev if he would be willing to participate in a sexual harassment program, he responded he would.

Vice Chair Lehman stated in Mr. Pulev's initial testimony he said he thought it was okay because Ms. Ravalo was his friend. Mr. Pulev stated he now realizes what he did was a mistake which is why he asked Ms. Ravalo to remove the kiss from the interview. Mr. Pulev further stated what he did was not only bad on Bulgaria but a bad example he doesn't want anyone to follow. Vice Chair Lehman asked Mr. Pulev if he thought Ms. Ravalo was his friend would it be okay to kiss her? Mr. Pulev responded he understands what he did wasn't right, and he has apologized. Vice Chair Lehman asked Mr. Pulev if he admitted to hugging Ms. Ravalo, he responded yes. Vice Chair Lehman asked Mr. Pulev if he had threatened Ms. Ravalo, he responded he had not but that some of his fans, his brother and his girlfriend said they had more video and would release those to clear his name. Vice Chair Lehman asked if some of the threats were from his brother, Mr. Pulev answered yes. Vice Chair Lehman asked if any of the threats were about doing physical harm to Ms. Ravalo, Mr. Pulev responded no they weren't.

Commissioner Araby asked Mr. Pulev if he believed what he did was wrong, Mr. Pulev responded yes. Commissioner Araby asked Mr. Pulev if he believed it was acceptable for boxers to use their position to force themselves on female reporters, Mr. Pulev responded no. Commissioner Araby stated his actions were not acceptable, and Mr. Pulev represents

the sport of boxing. Commissioner Araby added Mr. Pulev was smiling smugly as the video of the interview and kiss was shown and asked Mr. Pulev if he was sorry. Mr. Pulev responded he was sorry for his actions. Commissioner Araby thanked Ms. Ravalo for having the courage to bring this issue up and asked her if anything like this has ever happened to her before, she responded no.

Chair Carvelli asked Mr. Pulev how he came to be represented by Ms. Hashmall and Mr. Wirt. Mr. Wirt stated he is a co-promoter with Mr. Pulev and they work with Ms. Hashmall and the firm that she works for. Chair Carvelli thanked Ms. Ravalo for her presence at the meeting and asked if she would elaborate on what kind of actions she would like the Commission to consider taking. Ms. Ravalo stated she would suggest suspension, as him not being able to fight would be the only way he would learn.

Chair Carvelli stated the mission of the Commission is the protection and promulgation of health and safety, and as soon as EO Foster heard about the incident EO Foster needed no permission from the Commission; he quickly suspended Mr. Pulev. Chair Carvelli stated Mr. Pulev is suspended and that was done by EO Foster.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez recommended the Commission make this a teachable moment rather than take away Mr. Pulev's ability to make a living as a boxer. She recommended that Mr. Pulev be given either a;

Option 1:

- 6-month suspension with 3 months reprieve for the time served on suspension making the 6-month suspension over the end of June,
- complete a commission approved sexual harassment course within 45 days,
- and participate in a women's sport media sexual harassment prevention program or a similar program in the US, as approved by the CSAC. The name of the program would have to be submitted to the Commission within 14 days.
- In addition to the terms of the suspension, Mr. Pulev would be fined \$2,500. If Mr. Pulev doesn't complete all the requirements of the 6-month suspension, then the suspension would default to option 2.
- Any future behavior Mr. Pulev would be suspended for life if he were to anything similar in nature.

Option 2:

- 12-month suspension,
- fine of \$2,500 and Mr. Pulev would have to reapply for his boxing license and come before the Commission demonstrating that he had changed.
- Any future behavior Mr. Pulev would be suspended for life if he were to anything similar in nature.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez motioned to suspended Mr. Pulev until June 26, 2019, pending completion of a Commission approved sexual harassment course within 45 days,

participation with a women's sport media program or a similar program in the United States, and a fine of \$2,500; if Mr. Pulev fails to meet the terms he would be suspended for 1 year.

Vice Chair Lehman motioned to amend the motion on the floor to state that Mr. Pulev be suspended until the July 22nd Commission meeting where Mr. Pulev would be required to appear before the Commission and to add a note on his permanent record that the Commission be notified if anything similar in nature happens.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez amended the motion to state that Mr. Pulev is suspended until July 22, 2019, at which time he will have to appear before the Commission and confirm completion of a Commission approved sexual harassment course within 45 days, participation with a women's sport media program or a similar program in the United States, a fine of \$2,500, and a note added to Mr. Pulev's permanent record that the Commission be notified if anything similar in nature happens; if Mr. Pulev fails to meet the terms he would be suspended for 1 year.

Vice Chair Lehman seconded the motion.

Public Comments:

Nicole Culev stated that she respects the conditions on Mr. Pulev's license but recommended a dress code for women in sports media. She stated that her country, Bulgaria, felt violated by her outfit and that journalists should be required to display their credentials and not act like a fan. Mr. Pulev is one of the most beloved people in Bulgaria and he has inspired so many people.

Gloria Allred stated this was sexual harassment in her employment and Ms. Ravalo was harassed on the job which is against the law in California. What happened to Ms. Ravalo after she posted the video was retaliation because she had the courage to post the video and wanted the public to see that Mr. Pulev's actions were not permitted and were unwelcomed. Ms. Allred stated there needed to be appropriate punishment for his actions with serious consequences.

John Wirt stated they are taking the incident seriously, he and Mr. Pulev have taken a sexual harassment course. Mr. Pulev has agreed what he did was wrong and shouldn't have happened which is why he asked Ms. Ravalo to delete it. The 6-month suspension isn't appropriate for the action.

Amelia Pachulia stated she is puzzled by Ms. Ravalo's reaction to the kiss as she feels most women would have slapped or pushed Mr. Pulev. Instead, Ms. Ravalo was smiling and laughing.

George Armando stated he saw Ms. Ravalo in the parking lot and feels reporters should not be drinking on the job. He also stated Ms. Ravalo told him she was not licensed to be sitting ringside.

Mark Manalo stated Mr. Pulev has expressed concerns for his actions and has taken a sexual harassment course. He stated he understands that Mr. Pulev has been accused of making threats and retaliating but when pressed it shows that is the fans that are doing it. He stated the true facts show the true story of what happened, and he objects to victim blaming.

Commission Comments

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated the incident has been very public but wants the public to know if there is ever a future complaint someone needs to file it can be done anonymously.

Mr. Pulev's fight was on March 23rd; the video was published on March 24th; Mr. Pulev was sent a suspension letter on March 26th; and Ms. Allred held a press conference on March 28th. On March 29th, videos of Ms. Ravalo were published, then on March 31st Mr. Pulev was being interviewed and stated he had more video of Ms. Ravalo which could be released. On April 8th Mr. Pulev apologized to his fans. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez went on to state the bashing of Ms. Ravalo and Mr. Pulev needs to stop. The intent of Mr. Pulev doesn't matter. During the World Soccer Cup in Brazil, an estimated 30 female reporters and 10 male reporters were kissed, groped and grabbed. And, everyone should also be able to have the opportunity to learn. The Commission wants boxers to be able to go to other countries, make mistakes and learn from those mistakes. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez hopes all parties can move on and learn from this.

Commissioner Araby stated he supports the motion; the Commission is not here to pass judgement on the reporter. Mr. Pulev's actions were not acceptable, punishment is necessary, and the motion is fair.

Commissioner Ayala asked for EO Foster to investigate what the Commission can do to be proactive in preventing similar incidents. Commissioner Williams asked EO Foster his opinion of the recommended suspension. EO Foster stated he believes the Commission's recommended suspension of 6-months is right and the suspension has cost Mr. Pulev a major seven figure fight. EO Foster stated if Mr. Pulev does what is asked of him, he feels all parties can move forward. He added he thought the Commission was being generous in allowing Mr. Pulev to go back to work so soon and he will look into adding a code of conduct to the license application.

No further Commission or Public Comments

The motion passed 6-0 by roll call vote

Agenda Item 5-Review and Possible Action of Petition to Change the Decision for Kubrat Pulev vs. Bogdan Dinu bout on March 23,2019, in Costa Mesa, CA

EO Foster presented the Commission with background on the petition to change the bout decision. During the bout referee Raul Caiz Sr. took 1 point from Mr. Pulev during round 7 for an unintentional foul and Mr. Dinu was allowed up to 5 minutes to recover from the foul. The ringside physician was brought in to assess Mr. Dinu and after taking time to recover, Mr. Dinu stated he was able to continue boxing. Later in round 7, Mr. Dinu was knocked down with a legal punch and was able to continue boxing before Referee Caiz Sr. finished his count. The bout was stopped by Referee Caiz Sr. when Mr. Dinu was knocked down again during round 7 and was unable to continue. Mr. Cohen on behalf of Mr. Dinu is requesting the Commission declare the bout a “no contest”.

EO Foster informed the Commission Mr. Caiz Sr. was planning on attending but became ill and was not able to attend. EO Foster stated he didn't believe the overall outcome of the bout would have changed whether the foul was ruled intentional or unintentional and that if Mr. Dinu was unable to continue he should have told the referee. When Mr. Dinu went down, Mr. Pulev shouldn't have punched him, however, EO Foster stated he didn't believe the outcome would have changed. EO Foster noted referee Caiz Sr. is one of the best referees, however he should have positioned himself closer to the action.

Mr. Cohen showed the Commission a PowerPoint presentation that was included in the meeting packet and played video from the fight. Mr. Cohen pointed out Mr. Dinu was Romanian and didn't understand that he had other options besides continuing to box. Mr. Cohen pointed out on the video that while Mr. Dinu was down on the canvas he was fouled twice, one punch the back of his head and one downward punch that Referee Caiz Sr. ruled as accidental. Mr. Cohen agreed with EO Foster that Mr. Pulev didn't intend to strike Mr. Dinu however he did so twice.

Vice Chair Lehman asked Mr. Cohen why the difference between intentional and unintentional was important? Mr. Cohen informed the Commission the next slide in the presentation will explain the difference. Mr. Cohen presented the Commission with the ABC's rules and procedures regarding intentional fouls. Vice Chair Lehman informed Mr. Cohen the fight was conducted under California rules and only 12 round titles are conducted under ABC rules. Under California rules if the fighter can continue the bout. Mr. Cohen stated he was unaware the bout wasn't under ABC rules, but the fight was even on the cards and this was Mr. Dinu's opportunity.

Mr. Cohen presented the Commission videos of other fights where TKO/KO decisions were later overturned by the supervising commission after further review or appeal. Chair Carvelli inquired as to where one of the bouts Mr. Cohen presented were held. He stated Australia. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated in the bouts Mr. Cohen presented the

fighters in questions were knocked out and none of the bouts took place in California. Chair Carvelli stated he was at the Dinu vs Pulev bout and noticed Mr. Dinu kept tipping his head down and not protecting himself. He further stated he felt referee Caiz Sr. wasn't negligent. Chair Carvelli asked Mr. Cohen whether he was requesting the bout be ruled a disqualification instead of a no contest? Mr. Cohen stated they felt under the circumstances a disqualification was fair. The Commission requested round 7 of the bout be played in its entirety. After viewing round 7, Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked EO Foster for his recommendation. EO Foster recommended the decision stand but understood Mr. Cohen's argument presented. He stated he didn't see the 2 blows to the back of Mr. Dinu's head before he was knocked down, which is why in his opinion the bout wasn't affected.

*Commissioner Shen-Urquidez motioned to let the decision stand as is.
Commissioner Williams seconded the motion.*

Commission Comments

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated she would like to see better referee mechanics from Caiz Sr. She hoped someone of his caliber would have warned Mr. Dinu to stop ducking his head as that gives no legal place for the other boxer to punch. When a boxer is trying to hit someone, and a foul occurs there is not such a thing as a continuation. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez clarified in California since the foul was accidental the referee either takes away 1 point or 2 points. Referee Caiz Sr. took away 1 point. If you watch the trading of punches and the sequence of events, Mr. Pulev showed restraint before and tried not to hit Mr. Dinu in the back of the head. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated the injury didn't stop the fight and the decision should stand.

Vice Chair Lehman asked EO Foster if the Commission made a provision when the referee was unable to attend a written statement be submitted. EO Foster stated that was correct and it was confirmed Caiz Sr. would attend the meeting. However, Caiz Sr. called this morning and informed EO Foster he was sick and would be unable to attend the meeting.

Public Comments

Mr. Pulev stated Mr. Dinu was a friend of his and he felt Mr. Dinu understood the referee as his English was better than Mr. Pulev's.

No further Commission or Public Comments

The motion passed 6-0 by roll call vote.

Agenda Item 6- Subcommittees Updates

a. Pension Fund Subcommittee (Commissioners Lehman and Ayala)

Vice Chair Lehman informed the Commission a conference call was held in late March and issues with the Pension Fund were discussed. The holdback amount in the suspense account was increased from 20% to 50% and outreach was doing well, it should surpass the outreach of last year. Currently outreach is being done through social media and the Commission's website. The Commission is accepting bids for services to help locate boxer's that have a pension. Vice Chair Lehman stated the Pension Fund Subcommittee requested projections for 20 years out and addressed changing the eligibility requirements. The Subcommittee agreed to looking into the lapse in service requirement as it appears a fair number of boxers are losing pension because of the requirement. The stats have just come back, and the Subcommittee will be scheduling another meeting. The Subcommittee asked EO Foster to place a disclosure on the athlete applications about the pension plan.

Agenda Item 9-Discussion and Possible Action for a Timekeeper pay increase and review of the Officials pay scale

EO Foster informed the Commission that Timekeepers have not received a raise for at least 10 years, therefore he proposes a substantial increase. Timekeepers sometimes work up to 8 hours at an event which amounts to a lot of rounds. EO Foster proposes an increase of \$100. Vice Chair Lehman asked how many timekeepers are at each event. EO Foster responded for club shows 1 is present and for televised shows 2 are present. Vice Chair Lehman asked EO Foster if the proposed increase of \$100 was enough; EO Foster informed the Commission the timekeepers and promoters were good with the proposed increased amount.

EO Foster updated the Commission the motion made by Commissioner Williams at a previous meeting to have officials who are assigned to work title bouts also work a few of the undercard bouts is going well.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez motioned to approve the timekeeper pay increase proposed by EO Foster.

Commissioner Araby seconded the motion

No Commissioner or public comments

The motion passed 6-0 by roll call vote.

Agenda Item 9 – Business and Professions Code section 18640.5 requires the Commission to invite stakeholder testimony at Commission meetings in order to identify actions that may lead to greater opportunities for licensees to participate in major professional boxing contests

No stakeholder comments received.

Agenda Item 10 – Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

No public comments received.

Agenda Item 8-Executive Officer's Report

a. Update on the Commission's Sunset Review

Chair Carvelli stated that he EO Foster appeared before the Joint Senates on February 26, 2019. They discussed C3 Logix, weight cutting, transgender athletes and pay equity in female boxing. Chair Carvelli informed the Commission that it was a good exchange of information and that he felt they were happy with his and EO Foster's responses.

At the Joint Senate Meeting Dr. Pan asked what the Commission was going to be doing with the C3 data. Commissioner Dr. Williams updated the Commission on C3 and that the next phase will be to compare the data and use it when looking at the return to combat. The long-term hope is to use it to see if a fighter should be recommended for retirement. Commissioner Dr. Williams stated that the Commission was 1st and other states are now picking up on it, so the goal is to be able to share this data. Vice Chair Lehman asked Commissioner Dr. Williams if the Commission was going to share the baseline data and across the board assessments. Commissioner Dr. Williams stated that was correct.

EO Foster informed the Commission that Dr. Gluckman's office, the doctor's office that sees a large amount of the fighters, have discussed doing C3 Logix during fighter's office visits. EO Foster stated that this will increase the Commissions data and the Commission will have more resources in the field.

b. Budget Update for the support Fund, the Neurological Fund, and Pension Program

The EO presented to the Commission the updated revenue numbers as of May 2, 2019. The Commission deposited into the support fund \$2,476,239.37, the neurological fund \$12,935.25 and \$600,047.20 into the Boxers pension fund. The Commission is in a healthy financial state with 6 weeks to go in the fiscal year. The Commission saw an increase in streaming now with ESPN and DAZN. EO Foster estimated the reserve fund is close to 1.5 million. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked if there was an update on FI\$Cal; EO Foster responded they are in fiscal year 18/19 and the budget office is in the process of closing out fiscal year 17/18. EO Foster stated the Commission's revenue and pension fund are both good. EO Foster presented the Commission with reports provided by the budget office.

Vice Chair Lehman asked for the status of Cyril's report, EO Foster said he would get the report. Chair Carvelli stated as the Commission finds more boxers the pension fund will decrease and asked EO Foster to call Cyril for an updated report.

c. Report on pending and proposed Regulations

EO Foster gave the Commission the status of the proposed regulations; minor changes have been made by legal affairs, once those are finished it moves on to the review process, then up the ladder to AOL, then budget office and fiscal review.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked what the deadline was on the proposed regulations. Vice Chair Lehman stated the timeline doesn't start to run on the proposed regulations until the review process has finished. Commissioner Araby asked how long the process has taken so far; Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated it has been years.

d. Status update of Delegated Entities

- **California Amateur Mixed Martial Arts Organizations (CAMO)**

JT Steele, President of CAMO, presented the Commission with his report, which is contained in the meeting materials. He stated CAMO has been busy and summer is busy as well. CAMO has seen some interesting events as well as Combate TV events. Mr. Steele stated that CAMO is seeing a rise in female athletes and that the larger professional promotions are using CAMO athletes. Chair Carvelli asked if they have caught anyone with their drug testing? Mr. Steele informed the Commission that they have caught some notable athletes and have been surprised. In one bout one of the fighters tested positive with an 80 to 1 level of testosterone and the opponent who won refused to take the test after his bout and he ran out the back door. Both fighters were suspended. Positive THV tests have been very prevalent. Chair Carvelli asked if the use was for pain or recovery, Mr. Steele stated some of the fighters use it for both.

EO Foster informed the Commission that the drug test cups that CAMO uses have a threshold lower than a nanogram which is recommended by VADA. The cups don't register the level but is used as a good indication of a positive test. EO Foster stated he that the fighters aren't using THC as a performance enhancing drug and most likely aren't using it the day of the fight.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated if a fighter were to use it on the day of the fight, it would make them slower but would aid in masking the pain. The suspension or fine for that violation is low. EO Foster stated the Commission is tied to the WADA/VADA standards and if they change the level since it is in our regulations, ours will as well.

- USA Boxing (USA Boxing)

Mr. Mike McAtee presented the Commission with his written report, which is contained in the meeting materials. Mr. McAtee informed the Commission that in the 1st quarter 463 bouts were held with only 2 possible concussions. USA Boxing has partnered with the Police Officers League in Oxnard and believe they will have close to 850 boxers from all over the US present in November. On May 22nd the IOC will make the determination as to who be running boxing at the Olympics. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked if there is a possibility it might not be AIBA as the last EO has stepped down, Mr. McAtee stated that was correct.

Mr. McAtee stated that the listed expenses for the youth and female athletes are currently listed at \$0, the amount of the training spent on them will be listed on the July report. EO Foster asked for an explanation of the expenses associated with KO High Fight Night pro/am event as it was listed on the report as \$15,000. The Commission wants to do joint events with USA Boxing but why did this show cost so much. Mr. McAtee said he will check but this happened last year because the promoter listed all the expenses for the show on the amateur reporting. EO Foster stated he thought that was the case but wanted to bring it up. Furthermore, California wants to do more events with USA Boxing, but it must be where promoters can afford it. EO Foster informed the Commission that he has been hearing it was expense to work with USA Boxing and asked Mr. McAtee to investigate that. Mr. McAtee informed the Commission that the fee for an is \$305 and then \$100 per amateur bout on a professional card. The total USA Boxing fees for the KO Hight Fight Night would have been \$505, \$200 of which went to the local LBC for support. Southern California is the busiest in the country, the calendar is set in November which is why it is difficult to book an event.

- United States Fight League (USFL)

Jon Frank submitted his report to the Commission, which is contained in the meeting materials. Mr. Frank informed the Commission one of the events submitted to the Commission had an elbow injury from an armbar, which was the first one of the year. They have created a training module for coaches and officials and have reached out to CAMO to see if any of those officials would be interested.

Chair Carvelli asked if USFL and CAMO are doing any joint events? Mr. Frank stated they have held some events with CAMO and looking at doing some with IKF down the line, it's easier to have the events in the same venue with the same medical transport. Chair Carvelli asked if EO Foster could reach out to some of the other promoters to see if they would be interested. Chair Carvelli asked if he knew who many of the USFL athletes have graduated to CAMO or beyond? Mr. Frank stated that he did not know

but it seems to be a natural progression and some of the USFL athletes have gone onto the pro level. There is a skill gap between athletes in other states and California because of the USFL established program. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked for Mr. Frank to conduct an informal poll of the athletes that have gone on from USFL and report back to the Commission at the next meeting.

- **International Kickboxing Federation (IKF)**
Steve Fossum, President of IKF, submitted his report to the Commission which is contained in the meeting materials. Mr. Fossum informed the Commission they have 1 or 2 events coming up before the summer over. Mr. Fossum asked the Commission about fighter insurance coverage and what a promoter should do if the bill for the injuries sustained were over the amount of the coverage? Legal Counsel Swenson informed Mr. Fossum this would not be within the jurisdiction of the Commission and the promoter would need to get guidance from outside counsel. Mr. Fossum asked the Commission if IKF followed the same rules and regulations regarding transgender athletes? Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated IKF must at least follow the base of what the Commission does however this issue would need to be discussed later with EO Foster. Regarding fighters fighting out of state or on tribal land, safety is the main thing. When fighters fight on tribal land or where there is no commission those fights are listed as non-sanctioned fights. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez stated this issue should be further discussed with EO Foster.

Mr. Frank asked the Commission if an athlete could get a waiver to stay in a certain age group because of their birthday, Vice Chair Lehman stated USFL needs to refer to their rules on that. Commissioner Shen-Urquidez reminded the delegated entities that the rules were discussed before they were set, and this matter should be discussed later. Chair Carvelli stated that the delegated entities need to discuss these matters with EO Foster before the meeting.

e. Update on C3 Logix Sports Concussion Management Program

EO Foster presented the Commission the background of the C3 Logix program and informed the Commission they have tested a large quantity of the participants. EO Foster stated the Commission is now ready to move on to Phase II, a spreadsheet was presented showing where C3 Logix will be added. He stated when shows are being worked in the office the staff will now input whether the athlete needs to do a test or the date of the athletes last date. Commissioner Williams added this repeat testing will be a part of Phase II, the hope is some of the information will assist the Commission to better evaluate fighters. Chair Carvelli asked for Commissioner Williams to send points to EO Foster. Chair Carvelli stated he hopes that some of these items will be presented at the Sunset review hearing.

Commissioner Shen-Urquidez asked if it was possible to use this date to customize a return to play for each athlete instead of using the current arbitrary dates. Commissioner Williams stated in the future it could be possible and could be used as an incentive to get the athletes to participant.

f. Staffing Update

EO Foster and Mark Relyea conducted Athletic Inspector interviews on May 1st and 6th and submitted a list of 10 candidates to Human Resources and are waiting to hear if they are eligible. EO Foster stated hiring 10 more Athletic Inspectors will not cause an increase in Commission spending as some Inspectors have retired.

g. Upcoming Event Schedule and discussion regarding event activity

EO Foster informed the Commission on July 13th the UFC will be in Sacramento at the Golden One Center.

CLOSED SESSION

Agenda Item 13 – The Board will meet in closed session as authorized by Government Code § 11126(a) (1) the Commission will conduct an annual review of the Executive Officer.

OPEN SESSION

Agenda Item 14 – ADJOURNMENT

Meeting Adjourned.